

# DELIVERING THE CIRCULAR ECONOMY A TOOLKIT FOR POLICYMAKERS

# **SELECTION OF KEY EXHIBITS**

## DISCLAIMER

This document contains key exhibits from the report *Delivering the circular economy: a toolkit for policymakers*.

The report has been produced by a team from the Ellen MacArthur Foundation, which takes full responsibility for the report's contents and conclusions. While the key contributors and contributors listed in the acknowledgements provided significant input to the development of this report, their participation does not necessarily equate to endorsement of the report's contents or conclusions. The McKinsey Center for Business and Environment provided analytical support. NERA Economic Consulting provided support for the macroeconomic and policy analysis for Parts 2 and 3 of the report.

The report describes a methodology for circular economy policymaking. It also explores a range of policy options that Denmark – the country of the report's pilot study – could choose to pursue. The report does not recommend any specific policy intervention to Denmark or to any other country.

## **PROJECT FUNDER**



CIRCULAR ECONOMY AND TOOLKIT METHODOLOGY



Circular economy - an industrial system that is restorative and regenerative by design

**PRINCIPLE 1** 



1 Hunting and fishing

2 Can take both post-harvest and post-consumer waste as an input

SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation, SUN and McKinsey Center for Business and Environment, Growth Within: A Circular Economy Vision for a Competitive Europe (2015). Drawing from Braungart & McDonough, Cradle to Cradle (C2C).

The ReSOLVE framework: six action areas for businesses and countries wanting to move towards the circular economy

REGENERATE	<ul> <li>Shift to renewable energy and materials</li> <li>Reclaim, retain, and restore health of ecosystems</li> <li>Return recovered biological resources to the biosphere</li> </ul>
SHARE	<ul> <li>Share assets (e.g. cars, rooms, appliances)</li> <li>Reuse/secondhand</li> <li>Prolong life through maintenance, design for durability, upgradability, etc.</li> </ul>
OPTIMISE O	<ul> <li>Increase performance/efficiency of product</li> <li>Remove waste in production and supply chain</li> <li>Leverage big data, automation, remote sensing and steering</li> </ul>
LOOP	<ul> <li>Remanufacture products or components</li> <li>Recycle materials</li> <li>Digest anaerobically</li> <li>Extract biochemicals from organic waste</li> </ul>
VIRTUALISE	<ul> <li>Dematerialise directly (e.g. books, CDs, DVDs, travel)</li> <li>Dematerialise indirectly (e.g. online shop- ping)</li> </ul>
EXCHANGE	<ul> <li>Replace old with advanced non-renewable materials</li> <li>Apply new technologies (e.g. 3D printing)</li> <li>Choose new product/service (e.g. multimodal transport)</li> </ul>

SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation, SUN and McKinsey Center for Business and Environment, *Growth Within: A Circular Economy Vision for a Competitive Europe* (2015). Based on S. Heck, M. Rogers, P. Carroll, Resource Revolution (2015).

## Indicative prioritisation of ReSOLVE action areas for 20 sectors in Europe

			High	Middle	Low
ECONOMIC ACTIVITIES	REGENERATE	—	-	_	_
Information & communication services, media and telecommunications					
Scientific R&D, other professional, scientific & technical activities					
Education					
Human health and social work activities					
Administrative & support services					
Arts, entertainment and recreation					
Financial and insurance activities					
Legal & accounting head offices, consulting, architecture & engineering, TIC					
Distributive trades (incl. wholesale and retail trade)					
Manufacture of wood and paper products, and printing					
Public administration and defence; compulsory social security					
Real estate activities					
Manufacturing of textiles, apparel, leather and related products					
Construction					
Manufacturing of transport equipment					
Manufacturing of furniture					
Water supply, waste & remediation					
Manufacturing of elec. equipment, computer, electronic and optical products					
Manufacturing of machinery and equipment					
Manufacturing of rubber, plastics, basic and fabricated metal products					
Transportation and storage					
Agriculture, forestry and fishing					
Manufacturing of food, beverages and tobacco products					
Mining and quarrying					
Electricity, gas, steam and air-conditioning supply					
Manufacturing of coke, refined petroleum, chemicals products					
Manufacturing of pharmaceuticals, medicinal chemical, botanical products					
Accommodation and food service activities					

SOURCE: Adapted from Ellen MacArthur Foundation, SUN and McKinsey Center for Business and Environment, Growth Within: A Circular Economy Vision for a Competitive Europe (2015).

6 • DELIVERING THE CIRCULAR ECONOMY - A TOOLKIT FOR POLICYMAKERS - SELECTION OF KEY EXHIBITS

Estimated potential contribution of the circular economy to economic growth, job creation and reduction of greenhouse gas emissions



1 2030 scenario.

2 Full scenario; GDP impact equal to trade balance effect.

3 'Material efficiency scenario'; GDP impact equal to trade balance effect.

4 Net job creation from increased reuse, remanufacturing, recycling, bio-refining and servitisation.

5 Built environment.

6 Forestry, pulp and paper, machinery, equipment and electronics, built environment, food waste, P2P sharing. 7 Remanufacturing industry.

8 Ontario; Waste management and recycling industry.

9 Waste management and recycling industry; compiled from several reports, see http://ec.europa.eu/environment/circular $economy/index\_en.htm, http://ec.europa.eu/smart-regulation/impact/planned_ia/docs/2014\_env\_005\_waste\_review\_en.pdf$  SOURCE: NL: TNO, Opportunities for a circular economy in the Netherlands (2013); EU (1): Ellen MacArthur Foundation, SUN and McKinsey Center for Business and Environment, Growth Within: A Circular Economy Vision for a Competitive Europe (2015); EU (2): Cambridge Econometrics / Biointelligence Service / EC, Study on modelling of the economic and environmental impacts of raw material consumption (2014); SWE: Club of Rome, The circular economy and benefits for Society (2015); UK: WRAP, Employment and the circular economy: job creation in a more resource efficient Britain (2014); FIN: SITRA, Assessing circular economy potential for Finland (2014); EU, built environment: TNO / EC, Assessment of scenarios and options towards a resource efficient Europe: an analysis for the European built environment (2013); SCO: Zero Waste Scotland, Circular economy evidence building programme: Remanufacturing study (2015); EU, waste management: Zero Waste Europe, EU circular economy package: Questioning the reasons for withdrawal (2015); CAN: Conference Board of Canada, Opportunities for Ontario's Waste: Economic Impacts of Waste Diversion in North America (2014)

## **Step-by-step methodology**



### Schematic overview of sector-specific impact quantification



SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation

# Six policy intervention types with examples

	POLICY INTERVENTION TYPES	EXAMPLES				
	EDUCATION, INFORMATION & AWARENESS	Integration of circular economy/systems thinking into school and university curricula				
		Public communication and information campaigns				
	COLLABORATION PLATFORMS	Public-private partnerships with businesses at national, regional and city level				
		Encouragement of voluntary industry collaboration platforms, encouraging value-chain and cross-sectoral initiatives and information sharing				
		R&D programmes in the fields of, for example, material sciences and biosystems				
V	BUSINESS SUPPORT SCHEMES	Financial support to business, for example direct subsidies, provision of capital, financial guarantees				
		Technical support, advisory, training and demonstration of best practices to business				
	PUBLIC PROCUREMENT & INFRASTRUCTURE	Public procurement				
IEI		Public investment in infrastructure				
	REGULATORY FRAMEWORKS	Government (sector) strategy and associated targets on resource productivity and circular economy				
		Product regulations, including design, extended warranties and product passports				
		Waste regulations, including collection and treatment standards and targets, the definition of waste, extended producer responsibility and take-back systems				
		Industry, consumer, competition and trade regulations, for example on food safety				
		Accounting, reporting and financial regulations including accounting for natural capital and resources, and the fiduciary duty of investors and managers				
	FISCAL FRAMEWORKS	VAT or excise duty reductions for circular products and services				
ŧ		Tax shift from labour to resources				

# Mapping policy interventions to barriers

				<b>A</b>		(	*		IEI			S		
	High relevance Medium relevance		Informa- tion & aware- ness	Collaboration platforms		Business support schemes		Public   & infras	Public procurement & infrastructure f		Regulatory frameworks			
	Low relev	ance	i i	, te	labo- rms		pport		é	7 6	÷_			and tions
		BARRIERS	Public communicat campaigns	Public- priva partnershipa	Industry col ration platfo	R&D progr- ammes	Financial su to business	Technical support to business	Public procu ment rules	Public inves ment in infrastructu	Govern-men strategy and targets	<b>Product</b> regulations	Waste regu- lations	Industry, consumer, competition trade regula
ECC		Not profitable <sup>1</sup>												
	NOMICS	Capital												
		Technology												
	MAR	Externalities												
	KET FAII	Insufficient public goods / infrastructure <sup>2</sup>												
	LURES	Insufficient competition / markets												
		Imperfect information												
		Split incentives (agency problem)												
		Transaction costs												
	REGL	Inadequately defined legal frameworks												
ULATORY FAILURI	Poorly defined targets and objectives													
	Implementation and enforcement failures													
	S	Unintended consequences												
	SOCI	Capabilities and skills												
CIAL		Custom and habit												

1 At market prices excluding the full pricing of externalities such as greenhouse gas emissions, ecosystem degradation and resource depletion 2 Infrastructure defined as fundamental physical and organizational structures and facilities, such as transportation, communication, water and energy supplies and waste treatment

11 • DELIVERING THE CIRCULAR ECONOMY - A TOOLKIT FOR POLICYMAKERS - SELECTION OF KEY EXHIBITS



How economy-wide circular economy policy might complement sector-specific policy



#### POLICY OPTIONS TO ENABLE SECTOR-SPECIFIC TRANSITIONS<sup>1</sup>



1 One policy package per circular economy opportunity. For definitions of policy types, see Figure 7. SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation. Adapted from Ellen MacArthur Foundation, SUN and McKinsey Center for Business and Environment, *Growth Within: A Circular Economy Vision for a Competitive Europe* (2015).

### Example roadmap for packaging and implementing policy options









# Circularity baselining in the Denmark pilot

SCOPE	INDICATOR	DENMARK <sup>1</sup>	EU-28 <sup>1</sup>	
RESOURCE PRODUCTIVITY	<b>Resource productivity</b> GDP EUR / kg domestic material consumption	2.1	1.9	
CIRCULAR ACTIVITIES	Recycling rate, excluding major mineral waste & adjusted for trade <sup>2</sup> tonnes recycled/tonnes treated (percent)	60%	53%	
	<b>Eco-innovation index</b> Index with 16 indicators (e.g. green investments, employment, patents)	136	100 t +30	
WASTE GENERATION	Waste generated per GDP output, excluding major mineral waste tonnes / EUR million	40	69 -42	2%
	Municipal waste generated per capita <sup>3</sup> tonnes / capita	747	481	5%
ENERGY AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS	<b>Share of renewable energy</b> Percent of gross final energy consumption	26%	14%	
	GHG emissions per GDP output tonnes CO2e/EUR million	225	343 ↓ -34	

1 2012 values if not stated otherwise

2 Recycling of domestically generated waste (incl. exported waste, excl. imported waste)

3 2013 data

SOURCE: Resource Efficiency Scoreboard 2014 Highlights, European commission (2014); Eurostat; Statistics Denmark, Danish EPA

	POLICY INTERVENTION TYPES	EXAMPLES OF EXISTING INTERVENTIONS	EXAMPLES OF POSSIBLE ADDITIONAL INTERVENTIONS (AS OBSERVED AT START OF PROJECT AND NOT TAKING INTO ACCOUNT SUBSEQUENT ANALYSIS)
	EDUCATION, INFORMATION & AWARENESS	<ul> <li>Consumer information campaigns, e.g. 'Use more, waste less' and 'Stop Wasting Food'</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Systems thinking integrated in curricula</li> <li>Further pilot projects to demonstrate circular economy potential to businesses</li> </ul>
	COLLABORATION PLATFORMS	<ul> <li>Green Industrial Symbiosis programme</li> <li>Four new partnerships (food, textile, construction and packaging) as part of the Danish Waste Prevention Strategy</li> <li>Rethink Resources, an innovation centre to support resource efficiency in companies</li> <li>'Genbyg Skive' pilot project to re-use building materials to create business opportunities and reduce waste</li> </ul>	•
*	BUSINESS SUPPORT SCHEMES	<ul> <li>Fund for Green Business Development (EUR 27m 2013-2018) to support innovation and new business models</li> <li>Maabjerg Energy Concept (MEC) bio-refinery part funded by Innovation Fund Denmark (EUR 40m)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Dutch 'Green Deal' inspired programme to provide on-demand support to companies in implementing circular economy opportunities</li> </ul>
	PUBLIC PROCUREMENT & INFRASTRUCTURE	<ul> <li>Government Strategy on Intelligent Public Procurement contains initiatives to support circular procurement practices</li> <li>Strategy on waste prevention also contains an initiative to develop guidelines for circular public procurement</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Guidelines on the circularity of materials and products integrated into public procurement policy</li> </ul>
3	REGULATORY FRAMEWORKS	<ul> <li>Ambitious energy efficiency and GHG emissions targets, e.g. 40% GHG reduction by 2020 vs. 20% at EU level,</li> <li>Ambitious targets for recycling/incineration/landfill, updated every 6 years, e.g. recycle 50% of household waste by 2022</li> <li>Taskforce for increased resource efficiency to review existing regulations affecting circular economy practices</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>New metrics introduced to measure economic performance, e.g. complements to GDP such as natural capital</li> <li>Engagement at EU level to adapt existing or introduce new regulations relevant to the circular economy, e.g. product policy</li> </ul>
E	FISCAL FRAMEWORKS	<ul> <li>Taxes on extraction and import of raw materials, vehicle registration and water supply</li> <li>High and incrementally increased taxes on incineration / landfill to promote recycling and waste prevention</li> <li>Highest energy taxes in Europe (70% above EU27) and CO2 taxes</li> <li>Tax cuts designed to promote use of low-carbon energy</li> </ul>	Investigation into effects of tax shift from labour to resources

SOURCE: European Commission, Tax reforms in EU Member States 2013; IEA, Energy Policies of Denmark: 2011 review; Nordic Council of Ministers, The use of economic instruments in Nordic environmental policy 2010-2013; Danish legislative council, Waste management policy in Denmark, 2014; The Ex'Tax project, New era. New plan. Fiscal reforms for an inclusive, circular economy, 2014.





NOTE: Only producing sectors (24% of national GVA) and hospitals (3.5% of national GVA) considered SOURCE: Statistics Denmark (2011 data); Danish Business Authority; Danish Environmental Protection Agency; Ellen MacArthur Foundation



	Short-term (2020)	Long-term (2035)
BUSINESS & CONSUMER BEHAVIOUR	<ul> <li>Increased acceptance of performance based business models in businesses and the public sector, but still for niche product categories (e.g. ~10% of imaging / radiation equipment in hospitals, ~10% of machinery products)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Broad acceptance of access over ownership business models in businesses and public sector (e.g. ~30% of a broad range of products in hospitals, ~30-70% of machinery products)</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Households are comfortable using new separation systems introduced by municipalities as part of the "Denmark Without Waste" strategy (e.g. increase in collection rate of household plastic packaging waste by 15 percentage points)</li> <li>Significant remaining margins for improvement in waste reduction</li> <li>Rapidly increasing interest in sharing business models (e.g. shared residential and office space)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Fully optimised waste collection and separation infrastructure provided by municipalities and waste managers (collection of 70-80% of plastics for recycling)</li> <li>Avoidable food waste reduction approaching theoretical limits due to improved knowledge and use of best practices among consumers, businesses and public institutions (e.g. hospitals)</li> <li>Sharing has become the new norm for traditionally underutilised assets (buildings, cars, and durables)</li> </ul>
TECHNOLOGY	<ul> <li>Key circular economy technologies (e.g. cascading bio-refineries, bio-based alternatives to plastics, 3D printing and design for disassembly in construction, remanufacturing techniques), existing today at late R&amp;D or early commercial stage, have been successfully piloted</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Key circular economy technologies existing today at R&amp;D or early commercial stage have reached maturity due to accelerated innovation</li> <li>Increasing remanufacturing of machinery components for use in "as new" products enabled by increasing importance of software for performance</li> </ul>

Source: Expert interviews; DBA; Danish EPA; Ellen MacArthur Foundation.

Qualitative opportunity prioritisation of focus sectors in the Denmark pilot





High potential

Indirectly included or enabler of key sector opportunities

#### **QUALITATIVE ASSESSMENT OF POTENTIAL IN DENMARK PILOT<sup>1</sup>**



1 Assessment based on focus subsector, product category or material stream in each sector. Food & beverage: Waste/by-products from pork / dairy processing, residual biomass from agriculture, organic waste from households, retail & hospitality. Construction: New buildings. Machinery: Manufacturing of pumps and wind turbines. Packaging: Plastic packaging. Hospitals: Purchasing of goods. SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation





SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation



SOURCE: Statistics Denmark; Eurostat; Danish Climate Policy Plan; expert interviews; Ellen MacArthur Foundation

#### **CIRCULAR ECONOMY** • High-value circular flows (e.g. reuse, reman, cascaded value extraction for organics) Circular business models (e.g. sharing, leasing) **Renewable energy**

# Estimated potential impact of further transitioning to the circular economy in Denmark

Economy-wide impact by 2035. Absolute and percentage change relative to the 'business as usual' scenario.



 1 Employment impact modelled through conversion of labour bill to job equivalents via a wage curve approach (elasticity = 0.2). Percentage change is vs. 2013 total full-time employment (Source: Statistics Denmark)
 2 Change in Global CO2 emissions vs. Denmark baseline 2035 emissions; other GHG emissions are not included. SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation; NERA Economic Consulting

# Breakdown of potential economic impact by quantified opportunity



 Average between conservative and ambitious scenario. This sector-specific impact does not include indirect effects, e.g. on supply chains, that are captured in the economy-wide CGE modelling.
 Including scaling from machinery sector (including pumps, wind turbines and other machinery products) to adjacent manufacturing sectors (electronic products, basic metals and fabricated products, other manufacturing,

mining and quarrying)

SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation

# Barrier matrix for the ten prioritised opportunities in Denmark

### CIRCULAR ECONOMY OPPORTUNITIES

	Critical barrier ('make or break')									
	Important barrier (to scale-up / acceleration of lever)		ПП							
Limited or no barrier BARRIERS		Value capture in cascading bio-refineries	Reduction of avoidable food waste	Industrialised production and 3D printing of building modules	Reuse and high value recycling of components and materials	Sharing and multi- purposing of buildings	Remanufac- turing and new business models	Increased recycling of plastic packaging	Bio-based packaging where beneficial	
	m									
ÖNOM	CONOMI	Not profitable for businesses <sup>1</sup> even if other barriers are overcome								
	S	Capital intensive and/or uncertain payback times								
		Technology not yet fully available at scale								
	MARKI	Externalities (true costs) not fully refletcted in market prices								
	ET FAILU	Insufficient public goods / infrastructure <sup>2</sup> provided by the market or the state								
	RES	Insufficient competition / markets leading to lower quantity and higher prices than is socially desirable					-			
		Imperfect information that negatively affects market decisions, such as asymmetric information								
		Split incentives (agency problem) when two parties to a transaction have different goals					_			
		Transaction costs such as the costs of finding and bargaining with customers or suppliers								
	REGUI FAILU	Inadequately defined legal frameworks that govern areas such as the use of new technologies								
	LATORY RES	Poorly defined targets and objectives which provide either insufficient or skewed direction to industry								
		Implementation and enforcement failures leading to the effects of regulations being diluted or altered								
		Unintended consequences of existing regulations that hamper circular practices								
	SOCIA FACTO	Capabilities and skills lacking either in-house or in the market at reasonable cost								
	ORS ORS	Custom and habit: ingrained patterns of behaviour by consumers and businesses								

1 At market prices excluding the full pricing of externalities such as greenhouse gas emissions, ecosystem degradation and resource depletion 2 Infrastructure defined as fundamental physical and organisational structures and facilities, such as transportation, communication, water and energy supplies and waste treatment



Performance models in procurement	Waste reduction and recycling in hospitals



SOURCE: Ellen MacArthur Foundation; NERA Economic Consulting